MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ

TOTAL QUALITY MANAGEMENT IN METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITIES IN TURKEY

Ömer Faruk Gençkaya
Emine Yanar

Abstract

Municipalities are the closest public service units to people. Human settlements, migration, economic, cultural and educational activities as well as tourism increase the scope of and extent of services provided by municipalities. The organizational capacity in terms of human resources, finance and technology is a vital element to fulfill these duties. Such comprehensive entities aim at performing a quality management in these services, too.

Turkey is passing through a transition period in terms of metropolitan administration. The number of metropolitan municipalities and their activities accelerated for efficiency and effectiveness reasons recently. This challenges the principle of quality management in municipal services. This study attempts to analyze the current state of quality management capacities of metropolitan municipalities and describe the selected good practices.

Contrary to the traditional public administration model -self-sufficiency, direct control, upward accountability, uniformity and civil service system-,[1] new public management (NPM) perspective challenged these assumptions with market-oriented and private sector-oriented models.[2] In this respect, governance paradigm underlines developing and managing public policies not only from the perspective of government but also from the perspective of private sector and clients/ citizens. Expansion of the needs of people, administrative erosion, dissatisfaction of civil servants and several other factors which combined with global competitiveness led to the development of new reforms, new concepts, and methods in public administration.

Good governance concept elaborated by World Bank[3] highlighted effectiveness, accountability, transparency and predictability. The UNDP

[1] John Stewart and Kieron Walsh, "Change in the Management of Public Services," *Public Administration* 70, Issue: 4 (1992): 499-518.

[2] George A. Larbi, New Public Management Approach and Crisis States, United Nations Institute for Social Development (UNIRISD) Discussion Paper No. 112, (Geneva (Switzerland): Palais de Nations, 1999).

[3] World Bank, *Governance and Development* (Washington, D.C.: World Bank, 1992).

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ

further described the nine principles of good governance as *participation, rule of law, transparency, responsiveness, consensus orientation, equity, effectiveness and efficiency, accountability, and strategic vision.*[4] In other words, good governance closely related with the public service, where *good governance* would be very responsive to community's demands for public services with sufficient quantity and good quality.

This preliminary analysis is an attempt to describe the place and importance of service quality in metropolitan municipalities in Turkey. First, a conceptual framework in relation to quality, quality system, service quality and total quality management is provided. Second, the place and importance of municipal services in municipal government is evaluated. Finally, the data which is collected from the strategic plans (2014-2019) of metropolitan municipalities in Turkey is briefly evaluated.

QUALITY AND TOTAL QUALITY MANAGEMENT

The definition of quality is made in many different ways. There is no consensus in a single definition.[5] The concept of quality has been basically used for industrial standards as the Japanese Industrial Standards which is "a system of production methods that economically produces quality goods or services that meet the needs of consumers." Similarly another definition of quality is "to develop, design, produce and maintain a quality product that is the most economical, the most useful and the consumer is always satisfied".[6] From the perspective of consumer, the concept is defined as "the product and performance produced by the operator conform to the specifications" or "the consumer's judgment about the product or service produced by the operator".[7] Similarly and from a production and consumption point of view, quality is defines a balance between product features and products free from deficiencies.[8]

It is possible to describe product quality qualitatively in a narrow sense. In broad sense, quality is quality of work, quality of service, quality of everyone including workers and managers, quality of system, quality of

[4] United Nations Development Program, *Governance for sustainable human development* (New York: UNDP,1997).
[5] Masaaki İmai, *KAİZEN: Japonya'nın Rekabetteki Başarısının Anahtarı* (İstanbul: KALDER Yayını, 2014).
[6] Kaoru Ishikawa, *Toplam Kalite Kontrolü* (İstanbul: KALDER Yayınları, 1997).
[7] William Edwards Deming, *Out of the crisis* (Cambridge, MA: MIT, 1986).
[8] Joseph M. Juran and Frank M. Gryna (eds). *Quality Control Handbook*, 4th ed., (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1989).

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ

objectives which include all work-related processes.[9] In the past, the quality used in the narrow sense was seen as expensive and luxurious products. Quality is now widely considered as an important tool in many areas as a lifestyle and especially customer satisfaction. The reason for this change is the development in the world of technology.

The total quality management (TQM) process began with Frederick W. Taylor, developed with Walter A. Shewhard, W. E. Deming, J. M. Juran, Philip B. Crosby and Armand V. Feigenbaum.[10]

When the existing production systems during the Second World War failed to meet urgent needs, quality control in the US began to be implemented. The introduction of statistical quality control has provided a very significant advantage to the US during the 1930s.[11] After the Second World War, companies in Japan began to do everything in their power to survive. During the 1950s and 1960s, controlling quality and quality improvement were significant impact on the development of the concept of TQM in Japan and the US. The current structure of total quality management has emerged since then.[12] In the late 1960s, companywide quality control, quality management system and quality leaders concepts were evolved in Japan.[13] The best ways to ensure continuous improvement and introduced the "Plan-Apply-Control-Prevent" method known as "Deming Cycle" or "PUKO Cycle".

Today TQM is the name for the philosophy of a broad and systemic approach to managing organizational quality. International quality standards and quality award programs specify principles and processes of TQM.

The reason why TQM is attracted to the world is in fact a competitive power. Organizations wishing to compete in the market have adopted TQM and implemented it as a part of corporate culture. The fact that the production is carried out with *zero error* principle in every process is a philosophy that allows the consideration of the expectations of the customers and the participation of all the employees. TQM refers to giving importance to trainings, team work and constantly developing with leadership understanding

[9] Ishikawa Op.cit.
[10] Angel R. Martínez-Lorente, Frank Dewhurst and Barrie G. Dale, "Total Quality Management: Origins and Evolution of the Term," *The TQM Magazine*, 10, Issue: 5 (1998): 378-386.
[11] Ishikawa Op. cit.
[12] Imai Op. cit.
[13] Ishikawa Op. cit.

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ

which requires "managing people, by people".[14] Total quality management does not just look at the result of the system, it deals with all processes. Therefore, it is important that employees and managers work in a business unit in all processes. Importance of quality, all employees should be grasped and all employees should be involved in the decisions taken.

It can be said that the basic philosophy of TQM is customer satisfaction, giving importance to people and continuous improvement. Today, organizations use this method as a new management style.[15] There is logic of continuous improvement as in TQM. Contrary to the traditional management systems' error correction approach TQM include progress or improvement to prevent errors.[16]

There are important differences between traditional management and total quality management as mentioned before. In traditional management approach, "order and control" approach is dominant. In contrast, total quality management requires that people are precious and team work is prevailing.[17] Management, organization, human value and scientific methods are combined.[18]

1. Human factor: There is a parallel understanding between the quality of life of individuals and their business qualities. A person whose quality of life is provided individually will provide a quality work in business life. For this reason, the "first person" or "individual quality" in the process of total quality management is very important. However, the value that should be given to human beings has not been taken into consideration until recently. Between 1950 and 1960, the concept of management was mechanized. Companies that intend to increase their qualifications at the end of the cycle understand that they should not regard people as machines to meet their demands and should give importance to employees. This is the only resource that is not less important than the production factors. All other factors cannot produce more output than total inputs; the human factor, due to its quality, can produce more

[14] Gül Karadeniz, Kamu Çalışanlarınca Toplam Kalite Yönetimi İlkelerinin Algılanması (İstanbul Avrupa Yakası PTT Baş Müdürlüğünde Bir Uygulama). *Yüksek Lisans Tezi.* İstanbul: İstanbul Gelişim Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, 2015.

[15] Vicdan Altınok, "Toplam Kalite Yönetimi Yaklaşımı," *SÜ İİBF Sosyal ve Ekonomik Araştırmalar Dergisi* 1, Sayı: 2 (2001): 205-214.

[16] Ömer Peker, "Toplam Kalite Yönetimi ve Kamu Hizmetinde Kalite," *Çağdaş Yerel Yönetimler Dergisi* 5, Sayı: 6 (1996): 43-57.

[17] Fatma S. Önal, Toplam Kalite Yönetimi Uygulanması Durumuna Göre Kamu Kamplarında Karşılaştırmalı Bir Çalışma: Huzurevi Örneği *Yüksek Lisans Tezi.* Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, 2015.

[18] Peker *Op. cit.*

output than inputs.

2. Leadership: Managers need to take responsibility, take risks and manage their employees well. For this reason, "leadership" is the most important principle in total quality management. Leading the top manager in total quality management, adapting to dynamic conjunctures and ensuring customer satisfaction are assumed to depend on the leadership nature of managers.

A democratic and participatory leadership should be the key to successful implementation of total quality management. A sense of leadership that is expected to be obeyed by authority, discipline and orders will lead to poor quality by reducing employee motivation.[19] Participatory leadership implies that leaders themselves participate in total quality management activities and motivate them as an example to their subordinates.[20]

3. Customer orientation: TQM aims to ensure quality before anything else. Quality is determined by customer satisfaction. For this reason, the customer orientation principle is the cornerstone of the total quality management process.

According to TQM, when the company is transferring its work to another person, it should be ensured that it is as smooth as the customer is delivering. In other words, the employee should feel like paying the customer and work accordingly.

It is also possible to identify hidden claims as well as explicit claims of the customer. To be able to achieve this, the company and employees must be close to the customer. The customer should not be seen as a burden, but should be seen as the most important person in the company.

The individual we mentioned above as customers is also in the public domain. The same is true for the people. The implementation of a "people-centered" system by the state or local governments will ensure that existing powers remain in power.

4. Staff Training, Full Participation and Teamwork: Training of managers, engineers, technical personnel and workers at all levels of the company in total quality management is very important in terms of quality. The training activities should be on understanding and developing the quality requirement.[21]

---

[19] Yıldız Atmaca, Yeni Kamu Yönetimi Anlayışı Çerçevesinde Belediyelerde Kamu Hizmet Anlayışı Değişimi: Konya Büyükşehir Belediyesi Örneği. *Yüksek Lisans Tezi.* Selçuk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, 2012.

[20] SerkanYeşilbayır, Toplam Kalite Yönetimi. *Yüksel Lisans Tezi.* İstanbul Teknik Üniversitesi Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü, 2007.

[21] Talha Ustasüleyman ve Selçuk Perçin, "Bulanık Analitik Hiyerarşi Süreci Yaklaşımı İle Toplam Kalite Yönetimi (TKY) Uygulamalarında Kritik Başarı Faktörlerinin Önem

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ
Later on, the trained staff should be involved in how to do a good job and how to improve it. Participation is actively involved in the negotiation and conclusion of the decisions taken by employees. Participation principle will provide quality support for total quality management by reducing employees' feeling of being managed by others.

Responsibilities for full participation should be shared among the employees, and no person should be subject to competent ascertaining.[22] Accurate full participation will ensure quality by increasing firm performance. Because employee will fully understand how it can be beneficial to the company through full participation and will benefit in this direction.

In addition to training and participation, teamwork is another important principle. Teamwork is a necessity to achieve common goals. By means of solidarity, unity and collaboration, it is easy to establish appropriate standards for quality.

5. Adoption of Kaizen: Kaizen means "healing". Kaizen is a continuous improvement that includes everything from the workers to the managers and all the processes of production. The understanding of the continuity of healing is a Japanese tradition. Japanese proverb says that "If a person does not appear around for three days, he should look closely at his friends to see the changes on his return". This understanding lies beneath the Japanese's ability to stand up after World War II.

KAIZEN is a comprehensive principle that can be applied to all kinds of activities. According to KAIZEN, a company should not spend a day without change in at least one unit. This change should be focused on improvement and improvement. Total quality management will be successful and lasting when all these principles are adopted and implemented.[23]

TOTAL QUALITY MANAGEMENT IN PUBLIC SECTOR: MUNICIPAL SERVICES

Most developed countries in the world have switched to and made progress in the implementation of TQM.[24] TQM has gained widespread use in public health facilities in the United States and the United Kingdom in the 1990s. The transition TQM has also been encouraged in other public

---

Derecesinin Belirlenmesi," *Atatürk Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Dergisi* 26, Sayı: 1 (2012): 147-164.

[22] Peker *Op. cit.*

[23] Imai *Op.cit.*

[24] Coşkun C. Aktan ve Ulvi Saran, *Kamu Yönetiminde ve Kamu Hizmetlerinde Kalite* (Ankara: Hizmet-İş Sendikası Eğitim Yayınları, 2005).

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ

institutions. In 1992, 68% of public institutions in the US were working to implement TQM. The prevalence of TQM in Turkey among the Balkan countries has taken place in the years 1995. Today, total quality management is among the administrative reforms in the OECD, the EU and the Balkans.[25]

TQM is not just for quality control. Total quality management does not accept quality control made at the end of production. Quality service in TQM is carried out by all employees together in all processes. Despite some criticisms it is argued that if total quality management is developed by changing for public institutions, it will give very good results. There are researches on total quality management practices of public sector in Turkey. Many philanthropic organizations have received quality-related awards after practicing this philosophy. Of course, there are a number of difficulties experienced in these applications. It is difficult to persuade senior public officials while this situation is not much experienced in institutions composed of young people. It is one of the worries that managers often think that if they are not involved in the process or that they are rarely involved, it is only an understanding of the lower levels. These obstacles prevent the whole institution from being involved in the process of working together. In total quality management, where leadership is important, leadership is not involved in the process, preventing healthy outcomes.[26] The legislation system applied in public institutions which are contrary to TQM practices can be an obstacle to its implementation. For this reason, TQM is recommended to be changed and developed in the most appropriate way considering these legislations.[27] The way in which all quality standards in an institution can be realized lies in increasing individual qualifications. If all the people working at the institution have adopted quality and if they do make it a necessity, if they make it a way of life, it will be very easy to get the desired quality in quality at that institution.[28]

One can define municipalities as local governments elected by citizens to serve citizens within the limits set by law. With the Law No. 5393, which was enacted in 2005, the duties, authorities and responsibilities of the municipalities were redefined. It is stated that the municipality can be established in settlements with a population of more than 5,000 people and it is

[25] Onur Çetin ve Necdet Özçakar, "Kamu Sektöründe Toplam Kalite Yönetimi: Bir Kamu Kurumunda Amprik Bir Araştırma," *Marmara Üniversitesi İ.İ.B.F. Dergisi* 36, Sayı: 1 (2014): 351-372.
[26] Peker *Op. cit.*
[27] Çetin ve Özçakar Op. cit.
[28] Peker *Op. cit.*

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ
obligatory to establish a municipality in provincial and district centers. The establishment of metropolitan municipalities evolved since mid 1980s. According to the Law No. 6360 the number of metropolitan municipalities in Turkey increased up to 30 out of 80. A metropolitan municipality can be established in a city which has 750 thousand inhabitants at minimum. Due to population size, economic scale and similar characteristics it is difficult to compare metropolitan and ordinary size municipalities. On the other hand, municipalities are elected to work in a different way than most other public institutions. Local governments have a much closer relationship with the public than central governments and are able to keep the pulse of the public much better.

In the municipalities, the management approach focused on quality and productivity. These are especially related to the development of the city and the needs of the city, responsibility to the citizens, resource usage, diversification and consciousness in service demands, coordination between e-government institutions and legislative requirements. Quality management helps municipalities to understand the needs of their communities and allows administrators to contain cost and improve services.[29] In other words, TQM contributes to municipal processes in various ways:

1. The quality of the service provision is improved.
2. Satisfaction of the citizen increases.
3. Resource waste is reduced.
3. Service development time is shortened.
4. Productivity increases.
5. Increased flexibility in service offered to citizens.
6. The number of in-process operations is reduced.
7. The duration of the offered service is shortened.
8. The bond between the citizen and the state is strengthened.

A successful TQM, where these positive results can be achieved requires municipal organizations to have certain characteristics. These are being External Customer Focused, being Internal Customer Focused, leadership, training of Employees, team Work, continuous Improvement, error Prevention, management with Statistical Data, and cooperating with Suppliers.

The main problems preventing successful quality management practices in municipalities are legislation, bureaucratic obstacles, personnel regime,

[29] Jonathan P. West, Evan M. Berman and Michael E. Milakovich, "Implementing TQM in Local Government: The Leadership Challenge," *Public Productivity & Management Review* 17, No. 2 (Winter, 1993): 175-189.

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ
education system, management structure, guardian type supervision, lack of performance management system, tender legislation, political influence and technological inadequacy.

During the establishment of the quality system, many difficulties arise due to the reasons of the municipalities and the viewpoints of the administrators.[30] The municipalities connected to the Ministry of Interior by law are consistently under the control of the central government in terms of administration and budget. As a result, the transformation crisis which is manifest in any organization is much bigger in the municipalities. Although the public relations approach mentioned above has been adopted by many municipalities and institutionalized in practice, it has often been beyond the scope of a complaints box-system. This is one of the most striking examples of the fact that many municipal associations are not accustomed to such a unit required by the municipal law. Personnel in units such as public works and engineering or water works are not yet suitable for quality management. Personnel working in the municipalities are considered as civil servants if they are permanent staff. Legally, the municipal staff is subject to the civil servant number 657, the quality of the staff in the appropriate qualifications, and the formation of performance evaluation systems to restrict the practices of the management in many branches of human resources.

Although the municipalities are trying to overcome this by showing them as temporary workers, there are many jobs that need to be done in this area because the work habits and scope of previous legislation cannot adopt and implement the human resources approach in the municipalities.

Lack of competence in managerial aspects of management, lack of infrastructure needed to provide effective service, difficulties in management of processes in the quality management system in the service sector in general problems, and quality management practices in municipalities. Even e-municipality model which are put into practice by many municipalities for easier and effective management of processes are like blind born children due to misconceptions in many municipalities and from the point of view of administrations. The definition of municipality by a municipal system administrator who has been put into practice of e-municipal administration by saying that "e-municipality is built on accrual and deduction" clearly shows how much the viewpoints of managers should be changed.

Despite all these challenges, the quality management approach is a tool that

[30] Ülkü Arıkboğa, "Belediyelerde Toplam Kalite Yönetimi İstanbul Büyükşehir Belediyesi Gelirler Müdürlüğü Örneği," *Strategic Public Management Journal* No: 3 (2016): 53-75.

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ
will enable municipalities to identify, manage and control resources, and facilitate the establishment of modern public relations units, which will facilitate the transition to human resource management in the personnel management approach.

RESEARCH DESIGN

Municipalities are the closest public service units to people. Human settlements, migration, economic, cultural and educational activities as well as tourism increase the scope of and extent of services provided by municipalities. The organizational capacity in terms of human resources, finance and technology is a vital element to fulfill these duties. Such comprehensive entities aim at performing a quality management in these services, too.

Turkey is passing through a transition period in terms of metropolitan municipal administration. The number of metropolitan municipalities and their activities accelerated for efficiency and effectiveness reasons recently. This challenges the principle of quality management in municipal services.

This study is a preliminary attempt to describe the current state of quality management perception and practices of metropolitan municipalities in Turkey. The main research question is what is the place and importance of TQM in metropolitan municipalities in Turkey? What are the basic objectives and outcomes of implementing total quality management project, if there is any? How are these projects implemented from the perspective of TQM?

For this initial investigation, the Strategic Planning Documents of 30 metropolitan municipalities and their annual activity reports for 2014-2019 were coded manually. In coding process, the concepts of quality, total quality management, the related projects or projects which were included these tools, their principal objectives and outcomes are taken into account for the given period.

A GENERAL EVALUATION OF FINDINGS

This preliminary analysis indicates that the concept of quality and total quality management are considered by metropolitan municipalities widely yet not effectively. Within the scope of the written official documents, the major three metropolitan municipalities, namely Ankara, İstanbul and İzmir developed the fundamentals of these tools and they are in the process of specific implementations of their projects and improvements of the necessary tools, human resources and infrastructure (Table 1 **bold typed lines**). The

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ
second group of municipalities (*italic typed lines*) is in the process of setting up infrastructure gradually and in the process of developing special projects on quality control, total quality management etc. The final group of municipalities (regular typed lines) seems to be in the process of developing an understanding of culture of quality and total quality management in their institutions. It is obvious that this is a process of awareness, planning and capacity (infrastructure, human resources and finance) as a whole. The activities, objectives and outcomes of the relevant projects which were listed in the published documents need to be evaluated technically. The relevant projects are considered positive in the sense that training and certification are given priority. Technical capacity, service improvement and citizen satisfaction are underlined as the major outcomes generally. However, to what extent these outcomes were achieved and sustained in accordance with the total quality management principles are open to question. Therefore, a detailed analysis of the total quality management practices by the metropolitan municipalities is needed.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Aktan, Coşkun C. ve Ulvi Saran. *Kamu Yönetiminde ve Kamu Hizmetlerinde Kalite*. Ankara: Hizmet-İş Sendikası Eğitim Yayınları, 2005.

Altınok, Vicdan. "Toplam Kalite Yönetimi Yaklaşımı." *SÜ İİBF Sosyal ve Ekonomik Araştırmalar Dergisi* 1, Sayı: 2 (2001): 205-214.

Arıkboğa, Ülkü. "Belediyelerde Toplam Kalite Yönetimi İstanbul Büyükşehir Belediyesi Gelirler Müdürlüğü Örneği." *Strategic Public Management Journal* 3 (2016): 53-75.

Atmaca, Yıldız. Yeni Kamu Yönetimi Anlayışı Çerçevesinde Belediyelerde Kamu Hizmet Anlayışı Değişimi: Konya Büyükşehir Belediyesi Örneği. *Yüksek Lisans Tezi.* Selçuk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, 2015.

Çetin, Onur ve Özçakar, Necdet. "Kamu Sektöründe Toplam Kalite Yönetimi: Bir Kamu Kurumunda Amprik Bir Araştırma." *Marmara Üniversitesi İ.İ.B.F. Dergisi 36*, Sayı:1 (2014): 351-372.

Deming, William Edwards. *Out of the crisis*. Cambridge, MA: Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 1986.

İmai, Makaai. *KAİZEN: Japonya'nın Rekabetteki Başarısının Anahtarı.* İstanbul: KALDER Yayını, 2014.

İshikawa, Kaoru. *Toplam Kalite Kontrol.* İstanbul: KALDER Yayınları, 1997.

Juran, Joseph M. and Frank M. Gryna (eds). *Quality Control Handbook.* 4th ed. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1988.

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ
Karadeniz, Gül. Kamu Çalışanlarınca Toplam Kalite Yönetimi İlkelerinin Algılanması (İstanbul Avrupa Yakası PTT Baş Müdürlüğünde Bir Uygulama). *Yüksek Lisans Tezi.* İstanbul: İstanbul Gelişim Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, 2015.

Larbi, George A. New Public Management Approach and Crisis States, United Nations Institute for Social Development (UNIRISD) Discussion Paper No. 112. Geneva (Switzerland): Palais de Nations, 1999.

Önal, Fatma S. Toplam Kalite Yönetimi Uygulanması Durumuna Göre Kamu Kamplarında Karşılaştırmalı Bir Çalışma: Huzurevi Örneği. *Yüksek Lisans Tezi.* Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, 2015.

Martínez-Lorente, Angel R., Frank Dewhurst and Barrie G. Dale. "Total Quality Management: Origins and Evolution of the Term." *The TQM Magazine* 10, Issue: 5 (1998): 378-386.

Peker, Ö. "Toplam Kalite Yönetimi ve Kamu Hizmetinde Kalite." *Çağdaş Yerel Yönetimler Dergisi* 5, Sayı: 6 (1996): 43-57.

Peters, B. G. "The Changing Nature of Public Administration: From Easy Answers to Hard Questions." *Viešoji Politika Ir Administravimas* Nr. 5 (2003): 7-20.

United Nations Development Program. Governance for sustainable human development, New York: UNDP, 1997.

Ustasüleyman, Talha ve Selçuk Perçin, "Bulanık Analitik Hiyerarşi Süreci Yaklaşımı İle Toplam Kalite Yönetimi (TKY) Uygulamalarında Kritik Başarı Faktörlerinin Önem Derecesinin Belirlenmesi." *Atatürk Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Dergisi,* 26, Sayı 1 (2012): 147-164.

Stewart, John and Kieron Walsh. "Change in the Management of Public Services." *Public Administration* 70, Issue: 4 (1992): 499-518.

West, Jonathan P., Evan M. Berman and Michael E. Milakovich. "Implementing TQM in Local Government: The Leadership Challenge." *Public Productivity & Management Review* 17, No. 2 (1993): 175-189

World Bank. Governance and Development. World Bank: Washington, D.C., 1992

Yeşilbayır, Serkan. Toplam Kalite Yönetimi. *Yüksel Lisans Tezi.* İstanbul Teknik Üniversitesi Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü, 2007.

ANALYSIS OF STRATEGIC PLANNING DOCUMENTS OF METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITIES IN TURKEY, 2015-2019

MM	Quality	TQM	Projects	Activities	Objectives	Outcome
Adana	*X*		*Smart City*	*Training for employees*	*Institutionalization/service quality*	*Efficiency/effectiveness/savings/customer satisfaction*
Ankara	**X**	**X**	**TQM in Local Government**	**Recreation/ transportation/ assessment**	**Quality service in information technology/education/health**	**Citizens' satisfaction / institutional capacity**
Antalya	*X*	*X*	*Quality Management System/Geographical Information system*	*Assessment of institutional quality*	*Quality local services*	*Citizens' satisfaction/ institutional capacity*
Aydın	-	-	-	-	-	-
Balıkesir	*X*	*X*	*Parking area*	*Training for employees*	*Quality local services / Quality HRM*	*Institutional capacity*
Bursa	*X*	*X*	*Institutional financial management/internal auditing*	*Training for employees*	*HRM/ quality service*	*Citizens' satisfaction/ institutional identity*
Denizli	X	X	Institutional financial management/internal auditing	Training/institutional risk analysis	HRM/ Quality local services	Efficiency/effectiveness/savings/customer satisfaction
Diyarbakır	-	-	-	-	-	-
Erzurum	*X*	*X*	*Human resources management*	*Training and similar activities*	*Quality local services / HRM*	*Institutional identity*
Eskişehir	*X*	*X*	*HRM/ Performance Management*	*Training*	*HRM/ Performance management*	*Efficiency/effectiveness/savings/customer satisfaction*
Gaziantep	*X*	*X*	*Work safety/ Information technology*	*Certification*	*?*	*?*
Hatay	X	X	-	Training	?	?
Istanbul	**X**	**X**	**Urban management**	**Modeling / assessment**	**Effective responses to citizens' problems /Capacity development**	**Customer satisfaction/service improvement**
Izmir	**X**	**X**	**Quality Guarantee/ Management system**	**?**	**Capacity development/internal auditing**	**High quality in services**
K.Maraş	-	-	-	-	-	-
Kayseri	*X*	*X*	*Infrastructure*	*Certification /assessment*	*Productivity/security/quality*	*Customer satisfaction/service improvement*
Kocaeli	*X*	*X*	*Certification*	*Information system / certification / assessment*	*?*	*Customer satisfaction/service improvement*
Konya	*X*	*X*	*Sustainable air quality*	*?*	*High standard*	*?*
Malatya	X	X	Quality and Performance management	Meetings/ trainings	Quality service	Customer satisfaction/service improvement
Manisa	X	–	?	Citizens' satisfaction Surveys	?	Customer satisfaction/service improvement
Mardin	X	–	?	?	Transparency/participation	Efficiency/effectiveness/savings/customer satisfaction
Mersin	*X*	*X*	*Quality Center*	*Training/ certification*	*Productivity/security/quality*	*Efficiency/effectiveness/savings/customer satisfaction*
Muğla	X	X	Quality management works	Training/ survey/ assessments	Quality service/ Effective responses to citizens' problems /Capacity development	Efficiency/effectiveness/savings/customer satisfaction
Ordu	-	-	-	-	-	-
Sakarya			*Institutional quality/ process management/ internal auditing system*	*Surveys/ risk analysis / Training*	*Productivity/ quality*	*Customer satisfaction/service improvement*
Samsun	*X*	*X*	*Institutional quality*	*Certification/ training*	*Productivity/ quality*	*Customer satisfaction/service improvement*
Ş. Urfa	X	X	Institutional quality	Certification/ training	?	Customer satisfaction/service improvement
Tekirdağ	X	X	Institutional quality	Certification/ training/ surveys	Quality and citizen focused service	Customer satisfaction/service improvement
Trabzon	X	X	Institutional quality	Certification/ training/ surveys	Quality system	Customer satisfaction/service improvement
Van	X	-	Institutional quality	Surveys	Quality system	Customer satisfaction/service improvement

MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINEVİ